

# Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Landscape Impact Assessment



#### Prepared for Bayside City Council

12 November 2020

PO BOX 2157, PRAHRAN, VICTORIA 3181, AUSTRALIA STUDIO 7, LEVEL 2, 251 CHAPEL STREET, PRAHRAN, VICTORIA TEL 61 3 9530 2333 FAX 61 3 9530 2322 info@tbld.com.au www.tbld.com.au THOMPSON BERRILL LANDSCAPE DESIGN PTY LTD ACN 082 033 565 ABN 57 082 033 565

# Summary

The existing separate male/female public toilet facilities at Black Rock Gardens are the only public toilet facilities in this area of the foreshore and service the popular picnic/BBQ area, playspace and beach. The existing facilities were established many years ago and cannot be upgraded to meet current building standards or to provide for disabled access. They are screened from Beach Road and the Bay Trail and there are no direct sightlines to either existing toilet facility from the picnic/play, pedestrian crossing or beach access which reduces public safety and accessibility for visitors.

As outlined in the Council endorsed *Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan 2016* the aim is to replace the existing two toilets with a new consolidated facility of an equivalent combined footprint located closer to the popular playspace and picnic area. The proposed new toilet facility is a standard design, consistent with recommendations of the *Public Toilet Strategy 2019-2023*, and also includes a drinking fountain and bicycle repair facility. This same public toilet model has been installed to other locations along the foreshore and the architectural design is not the subject of this assessment.

The landscape impact assessment seeks to evaluate the options for replacement including rebuilding on the current site, a new facility as per current Council plans (Option C) and other siting options to determine a better location can be identified to minimise community concerns regarding the impact on views and public safety while meeting the legislative and coastal design requirements for establishment of a new public toilet facility on the foreshore in this area.

Location options considered in this assessment must not require removal of indigenous vegetation and comply with the requirements of applicable current legislation including:

- Aboriginal Heritage Act 2006 and Aboriginal Heritage Regulations 2018
- Disability Discrimination Act 1992
- AS1428 Access and Mobility
- Victorian Marine and Coastal Policy 2020
- Bayside Planning Scheme

Location options are also assessed against other relevant guidelines including:

- Coastal Siting and Design Guidelines for structures on Victorian coast, DELWP 2020
- Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED), Victoria Police 2015

In conclusion I recommend that Council consider redevelopment of the proposed public toilet facility in accordance with Option B, further north of the clocktower between the existing toilet blocks but closer to Beach Road and the Bay Trail as this location provides the following advantages:

- Enhanced screening from existing coastal vegetation to minimise visual impact on key views to the coast from Beach Road, Bluff Road/Balcombe Road.
- Enhanced screening from existing coastal vegetation to minimise visual impact on key views to the Clocktower and beacon sculpture.
- Acceptable CPTED public safety provisions with clear lines of sight from both pedestrian crossings, the Bay Trail and more than half the picnic/BBQ/play space area.
- Close proximity to the Bay Trail allowing consolidation of proposed drinking fountain and bicycle repair facilities.
- Located close to the existing sewer minimising required ground disturbance and cost.

# **Table of contents**

#### Summary

1	Introduction	4
1.1	The need for new public toilet facilities	4
1.2	Key design requirements	5
1.3	Summary of potential siting options	5
1.4	Other options considered	7
2	Key siting and design considerations	9
2.1	Disability Discrimination Act (DDA)	9
2.2	Aboriginal Cultural Heritage	9
2.3	Marine and Coastal Policy	10
2.4	Coastal Siting and Design Guidelines	11
2.5	Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED)	13
3	Conclusion	16
A	Reference documents and materials	17
В	Figures	18

Figure 1 Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Location Options, November 2020

Figure 2 Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Location Views 1 and 2, November 2020

Figure 3 Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Location Views 3 and 4, November 2020

Ardent Architects P/L 2019 'Bayside Standard Two Bays Amenities Block' Concept Design Sheet 101.

# 1. Introduction

## 1.1 The need for new toilet facilities

The only existing public toilets on the foreshore at Black Rock are midway between the Black Rock Life Saving Club and the playspace and picnic/BBQ area. The public toilets are heavily used as they service beach visitors, the popular playspace/BBQ/picnic area, cyclists using Beach Road/Bay Trail and walkers using the Coast Walking Path.

The existing male and female toilet facilities are located in separate identical independent buildings. The buildings are not of heritage significance but are regularly painted in coastal colours and are well maintained. Refer Photo 1. Both facilities are screened by dense coastal vegetation and the west (coast) facing access points are not visible from either Beach Road or the playspace/picnic area. This arrangement, despite upgrades to public lighting in the area, creates a public safety risk due to a lack of passive surveillance.

The *Public Toilet Strategy 2019-2023* assessed all 62 public toilet facilities within Bayside. The assessment criteria for replacement was based upon facility demand, performance, accessibility, and safety. The strategy recommended replacement of the existing Black Rock facilities as a top priority given:

- the high user driven demand
- age/condition of the internal facilities
- lack of internal and external accessibility for wheelchairs
- safety concerns in terms of their physical location, lighting, opportunities for concealment, and lack of casual surveillance by those passing by.



Photo 1 – Existing Black Rock Foreshore Public Toilet Facilities (Male)

Engineering assessment concluded it was not structurally possible to upgrade the existing buildings to widen the entries and internal access points to accommodate wheelchair use and building code requirements. Therefore full replacement was recommended as the only way to meet current accessibility and public safety standards.

## 1.2 Key design requirements

The foreshore at Black Rock is Crown Land with Bayside City Council having committee of management responsibility in accordance with the requirements of the *Crown Land Reserves Act (1978)*. Works on the foreshore are subject to consent provisions under the *Marine and Coastal Act (2018)* and the *Victorian Coastal Strategy (2014)*.

Location options considered for replacement of the toilet facility must also comply with the requirements of the following legislation including:

- Aboriginal Heritage Act 2006 and Aboriginal Heritage Regulations 2018
- Disability Discrimination Act 1992 (access to premises) and AS1428 Access and Mobility
- Victorian Marine and Coastal Policy 2020 and Coastal Siting and Design Guidelines for structures on Victorian coast, DELWP 2020.
- Bayside Planning Scheme, Bayside City Council

Other considerations include:

- Public safety and Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) principles.
- Impacts on the Black Rock foreshore landscape character including views to the clocktower, beacon sculpture and bay.

## **1.3** Summary of potential siting options (Refer Figure 1)

#### **1.3.1** Option A - Rebuild on the site of the existing toilets This option involves demolishing and building the new public toilet on the site of the

existing male toilet facilities (closes to the playspace/picnic area) and demolishing the female toilet facility.

- a) Option A Advantages:
  - Screened on three sides by existing vegetation this option ensures no visual impact on key views to the clocktower, beacon sculpture and bay.
  - Existing sewer, water and electrical connections will be reused minimising ground disturbance and cost.
  - No removal of coastal vegetation.

#### b) Option A Disadvantages:

- Provides the least acceptable CPTED public safety rating as there is no natural surveillance with restricted sightlines to the location from Beach Road and the Bay Trail and no surveillance from the playspace/BBQ/picnic area.
- The proposed bike repair station and drinking fountain will need to be separated from the toilet facility and located closer to the Bay Trail.
- The existing unsealed path connection from the Bay Trail to the new toilet facility and coast walking path will need to be upgraded to concrete.
- There are no sightlines to this location from the adjoining pedestrian crossings and beach access points requiring additional signage to alert new visitors to the toilet location.

#### **1.3.2** Option B – New location north of the clocktower

This option involves building the new public toilet closer to the life saving club adjoining the Bay Trail and demolishing the existing male/female toilet facilities.

#### a) Option B Advantages:

- Partially screened by existing vegetation this location option will impact less on key views to the clocktower, beacon sculpture and bay than Option C and D.
- Provides adequate compliance with CPTED public safety provisions with clear lines of sight from both pedestrian crossings, the Bay Trail and more than half the picnic/BBQ/play space area.
- There are clear sightlines to this location from both adjoining pedestrian crossings and beach access tracks reducing the need for signage.
- The proposed bike repair station and drinking fountain can be co-located with the toilet facility, directly adjoining the Bay Trail.
- Located closer to the existing sewer and electrical and water service connection points minimising ground disturbance and cost. The new facility will also include solar power.
- Demolition of the existing toilet facilities will create additional grass open space and sheltered picnic spots away from Beach Road with views to the bay.

#### b) Option B Disadvantages:

Located slightly further away from the playspace/BBQ/picnic area than other options.

#### 1.3.3 Option C – Opposite the clocktower

This location option is the current Council design proposal used for consultation and involves building the new public toilet adjoining the Bay Trail directly opposite the clocktower and demolishing the existing male/female toilet facilities.

- a) Option C Advantages:
  - Provides the highest CPTED public safety rating given clear sightlines from Beach Road, the Bay Trail and the playspace/BBQ/picnic area.
  - There are clear sightlines to this location from both adjoining pedestrian crossings and beach access tracks.
  - The proposed bike repair station and drinking fountain will be co-located with the toilet facility, directly adjoining the Bay Trail.

- Demolition of the existing toilet facilities will create additional grass open space and sheltered picnic spots away from Beach Road with views to the bay.
- The new facility will also include solar power.
- b) Option C Disadvantages:
  - Highest impact on key views to the clocktower, beacon sculpture and bay.

#### 1.3.4 Option D – near the play space

This location option involves building the new public toilet between the Bay Trail and play space immediately south of the pedestrian crossing and demolishing the existing male/female toilet facilities.

#### a) Option D Advantages:

- Provides adequate CPTED public safety rating given clear sightlines from Beach Road, the Bay Trail and the playspace/BBQ/picnic area.
- Less impact on key views to the clocktower, beacon sculpture and bay than Option C.
- Demolition of the existing toilet facilities will create additional grass open space and sheltered picnic spots away from Beach Road with views to the bay.

#### b) Option D Disadvantages:

- Highest impact on views to foreshore from adjoining businesses on Beach Road.
- Located twice as far away from the main beach and access ramp.
- Insufficient room for the bicycle repair station and drinking fountain which will need to be located separately further north along the Bay Trail.
- Requires additional excavation and ground disturbance to achieve sewer and other service connections including a pumping station and 240v connection.

## 1.4 Other options considered

The following is a summary of other options considered and reasons why they were ruled out.

#### **1.4.1** Location options on the coast side close to the Coast Walking Path.

Locations away from Beach Road and closer to the coast are not supported. Reasons for this include:

- It may not be possible to achieve a gravity sewer connection requiring a pumping station and additional electrical connection impacting on existing cultural heritage values. It is also more likely that works will impact on existing coastal vegetation and increase cost.
- Siting away from the Bay Trail and Beach Road is unlikely to meet CPTED public safety requirements for clear sightlines without removal and/or ongoing management of coastal vegetation.
- Sealed paths would need to be extended from the Bay Trail to the new facility and this may contribute to increased cycling use on the coast walking path and conflicts with pedestrians and environmental values.
- Facilities may be subject to coastal erosion and the longer term impacts of sea level rise.

#### **1.4.2** Location options within the playspace and picnic area

Locations within the playspace and picnic area are not supported. Reasons for this include:

- It may not be possible to achieve a gravity sewer connection requiring a pumping station and additional electrical connection impacting on existing cultural heritage values.
- Connection of services will be more expensive and may impact on existing trees and coastal vegetation.
- Location of public toilet facilities at this end of the gardens will provide limited service to beach users.

#### 1.4.3 Location within the Black Rock Life Saving Club

While it will be desirable to have a new publicly accessible toilet and change facility located within a new Black Rock Life Saving Club the new building the design and timing for this redevelopment are not known.

Location of a new public toilet facility at the Black Rock Life Saving Club end of the gardens will improve access and facilities for beach users but will not replace the need for a new accessible public toilet facility to service the popular playspace/BBQ/picnic area.

# 2. Key siting and design considerations

# 2.1 Disability Discrimination Act 1992 (access to premises) and AS1428 Access and Mobility

A person with a disability has a right to have access to places used by the public. The Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) makes it against the law for public places to be inaccessible to people with a disability.

The siting and design of new public toilets at Black Rock Gardens must comply with these requirements including:

- Access via a sealed concrete path with a grade less than 1 in 20 and crossfall less than 1 in 40.
- Full provision for wheelchair access to cubicles, hand washing, the drinking fountain and bicycle repair area.
- Tactile and braille signage for people with vision impairment.

Proposed siting options B, C and D meet DDA requirements. Option A, replacement of the existing toilets in their current location would require a new concrete path to be constructed along the alignment of the existing unsealed path.

## 2.2 Aboriginal Cultural Heritage

The land presently encompassed by the City of Bayside has likely been occupied by Aboriginal people for over 35,000 years and Black Rock is located within the traditional country of the Boonwurrung people. Use of coastal land by Boonwurrung people survives in the form of archaeological sites and significant places associated with the use of the land and recent events in the history of the Boonwurrung people.

Aboriginal Heritage Regulations 2018 state that land within 200 metres of the high water mark of the coastal waters of Victoria is an area of cultural heritage sensitivity. Consultation with the traditional owners was completed by Council in 2015 and 2016 as part of the Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan. Subsequent cultural heritage due diligence assessment recommended replacement of the existing toilet facilities to areas of previous significant ground disturbance in order to minimise potential impacts on Aboriginal cultural heritage during the works.

- **2.2.1** Location Option C (opposite the clocktower) cultural heritage due diligence assessment has been completed by Heritage Insight March 2020 for the new toilet facility at this location as indicated in the Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan. The assessment concluded that construction of the toilet block, drinking fountain and bike repair station using screw piles supporting a concrete slab and gravity sewer in this location is unlikely to impact on Aboriginal cultural heritage.
- (a) This is because all of the works apart from the installation of the screw piles will occur in a soil layer which has demonstrably undergone significant ground disturbance associated with the recent historical use of the land and the duplication of Beach Road and is unlikely to contain Aboriginal cultural heritage.

- (b) Previous assessments along the foreshore have indicated that there is a low likelihood that Aboriginal places will be found on land near Beach Road. They are more likely to be found amongst the tea tree scrub some 50m to the west.
- c) The screw piles are the only component of the toilet block which will be excavated into sand below the fill layer. These will cause minimal displacement of the sand layer below the fill and the lower sand unit is also not the original natural soil surface above the bluff.
- **2.2.2** Location Option A (replacement on the site of the existing male toilet block) is located within 50m of Beach Road and in an area previously disturbed via establishment of the existing building and service connections. Sewer and other service connections will also utilise existing pipes minimising the need for additional excavation.
- **2.2.3** Location Option B (north of the clocktower) is located within 50m of Beach Road and within the same area of fill as identified in the Heritage Insight assessment for Option C. Sewer and other service connections are closer to the required connection points reducing the need for excavation and will follow the same alignment as assessment completed for location C.
- **2.2.4** Location Option D (near the playspace) is located within 50m of Beach Road but twice the distance from the existing sewer connection point. Gravity sewer connection is not possible at this location and a new pump and electrical connection will be required. Further assessment is required to determine depths and although excavation would be aligned with the Bay Trail and Beach Road to minimise potential impacts the required works are likely to significantly increase cost and potential impact on cultural heritage values however the scope of this is not possible to estimate based on current available information.

## 2.3 Marine and Coastal Policy March 2020

The Victorian Government Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning published the *Marine and Coastal Policy, March 2020*. This is a long-term policy to deliver a healthy, dynamic and biodiverse marine and coastal environment that is valued in its own right and that benefits the Victorian community now and in the future. It recognises the many benefits from sustainable uses, activities and developments. The Policy will be accompanied by a Coastal Strategy which will outline priority actions and is forecast to be prepared in 2021.

The Policy includes a section on Managing coastal hazard risk with a pathway approach guiding decisions regarding the most appropriate method to deal with the coastal hazards and risks including:

- Non-intervention, including allowing the processes to occur where they pose no immediate risk
- Avoid, locating new development and uses away from areas that are impacted
- Nature-based methods, including for example using planting and revegetation as a measure to control erosion in preference to built structures
- Accommodate, including designing infrastructure that reduces the exposure to risk, for example lifesaving towers that can be easily moved.
- Retreat, including decommissioning assets and relocating them away from areas that will be negatively impacted.

• Protect, where existing feature are reinforced or modified to mitigate the coast hazard, for example modifying sea walls.

All options considered comply with the Marine and Coastal Policy, March 2020

## 2.4 Coastal Siting and Design Guidelines For Structures on Victorian Coast

The Marine and Coastal Policy provides the policies for use and development on the coast while the Siting and Design Guidelines provide further details, examples of excellence and inspiration for how the policies apply. The Guidelines apply to all development on Victoria's coast, whether on public or private land. They provide a set of fundamental considerations that underpin best practice for future use and development of structures and facilities on the coast.

#### 2.4.1 Climate change and adaption

Climate change is exacerbating existing threats (such as inundation and erosion) and introducing new threats (such as sea level rise and increased ocean temperatures). Any upgrade or rebuilding design must ensure that the structure can adapt to the anticipated increase in coastal hazards including sea level rise over the structures intended life span.

#### Assessment:

• The existing toilets and replacement location Options B, C and D are located away from the coast and will not be impacted on by sea level rise or coastal erosion.

#### 2.4.2 Footprint

New structures should minimise their footprint, including their height. The height and scale of any structure should be designed to be appropriate to its context. Replacing or modifying an existing structure, should consolidate or minimise, the footprint and impact as far as possible.

#### Assessment:

- Replacement of the two existing separate male/female toilet facilities with a single building does not increase the total built footprint on the foreshore.
- The proposed Bayside City Council public toilet design has been recently used in other locations along the foreshore and is therefore considered an appropriate height and scale.

#### 2.4.3 Siting and design fundamentals

#### a) <u>Aboriginal Cultural Heritage</u>

Consultation with traditional owners was completed in 2015 and 2016 as part of the Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan which recommended replacement of the existing toilet facilities.

Cultural heritage assessment for the area has been completed by Heritage Insight March 2020 and is further detailed in Section 2.2

# b) <u>Coastal Processes</u> The existing toilets and replacement location options are located away from the coast and will not impact on coastal processes.

 <u>Geology</u>, <u>Morphology and Hydrology</u>
All options are located in areas of modified landform and fill with footings designed to suit the site geology. All options do not impact on site morphology or hydrology.

#### d) <u>Vegetation and Ecology</u>

Replacement of the existing toilets in the same location and replacement location options B, C and D do not require removal of vegetation and connection of underground services will also remain clear of tree and vegetation protection zones.

#### e) <u>Climatic Conditions</u>

The existing toilet location is slightly more exposed to the prevailing winds and doors will need to be located on the windward side. Other location options B, C and D are protected from prevailing winds and doors can be located on the preferred leeward side.

All location options have good ventilation and access to sunlight in winter.

 f) <u>Views</u> Visual impact assessment is further detailed in Section 1.3 and Figure 2 and 3.

#### g) <u>Public Open Space</u>

The location of the existing toilet facilities provides better shelter and views to the coast than the potential replacement location options B, C and D which are closer to Beach Road and the Bay Trail. Therefore removal of existing toilet facilities will enhance public open space amenity by providing additional sheltered picnic spots with views to the coast.

#### h) Local character and sense of place

The new toilet facility is a Bayside City Council standard design which has been used in other areas along the Bayside foreshore.

The clocktower, beacon sculpture and framed views to the coast at the Beach Road roundabout are central to the local character and Black Rock's sense of place. Refer Figure 3 and 4.

Location Option A (site of the existing facilities) and B (north of the clocktower) utilise existing coastal vegetation to screen views to the new toilet facility and minimise impacts on views to the coast, clocktower and beacon sculpture. Refer Figure 2 and 3.

Location C (current Council design) has the most impact on views to the coast, clocktower and beacon sculpture.

Location D (near the play space) will impact on views to the clocktower for southbound traffic on Beach Road and for adjoining businesses but has minimal impact on views to the bay and southern Beach Road and Bay Trail approach.

#### i) <u>Public Access</u>

The public toilets service the popular playspace/BBQ/picnic area, play space, beach visitors, cyclists using Beach Road and the Bay Trail and walkers using the Coast Walking Path.

Location Option B and C are located close to Beach Road and clearly visible from both pedestrian crossings and located directly adjacent to the Bay Trail and less than 60m from the picnic/BBQ area, play space and beach access ramps. The location of the existing toilets, Option A, has no direct views from the picnic/BBQ/play space area, pedestrian crossings and limited views from the Bay Trail. This location provides restricted public access.

Location Option D closer is closer to the play space and will disadvantage visitors to the main beach area located north of the life saving club ramp. This could be offset by longer term establishment of another new public toilet facility as part of future redevelopment of the Black Rock Life Saving Club but design and timing for this is redevelopment is unknown.

j) Increased Function and Adaptability

The siting options considered are located away from the coast and do not require protective structures. Replacement of the two separate buildings with a single structure reduces the built form on the foreshore.

Moving the new toilet facility closer to the Bay Trail (Options B, C and D) will allow the site of the existing buildings, located away from the road, to returned to grass or used for additional sheltered picnic tables with enhanced views to the coast.

 Sustainability, Materials and Finishes The proposed new toilet facility is a Bayside City Council standard design which has been used elsewhere on the Bayside Foreshore. The new facility will include solar power and utilises recycled cladding materials.

## 2.5 Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED)

Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design or CPTED is an approach to crime prevention that takes into account the relationship between the physical environment and the users of that environment. We all recognise when the space we are in sends us a message about safety, "this is a safe place" or danger, "this is an unsafe place". The theory behind CPTED is that the design of a physical environment can produce behavioural effects that will reduce both the incidence and fear of crime. These behavioural effects can be accomplished by reducing the susceptibility of the environment to support criminal behaviour. (Victoria Police, June 2015)

There are three basic strategies in CPTED:

- Natural surveillance
- Natural access control
- Territorial reinforcement

#### 2.5.1 Natural surveillance

Natural surveillance is a design concept that aims to keep potential offenders and intruders under observation through the creation of environments where there is sufficient opportunity for people engaged in their normal behaviour to observe the space around them. The underlying principle is that a person is less likely to commit a crime if they think someone will see them do it.

Design for natural surveillance for public toilet facilities at Black Rock Gardens should consider the following:

- Placement to maximise the number of persons who can see clearly to that location preferably from Beach Road and adjoining businesses and private property.
- Orientation such that there are uninterrupted views to the doors of the new facility from the picnic/BBQ/play area allowing parents to visually track children to and from the facility.

#### 2.5.2 Natural access control

The design concept of access control is directed primarily at decreasing criminal accessibility. Natural access control restricts criminal intrusion, in particular into areas where they will not be easily observed. The goal with this principle is not necessarily to keep intruders out but to direct the flow of other people through the area to decrease the opportunity for crime.

Design for natural access control for public toilet facilities at Black Rock Gardens should consider the following:

- A location with direct access to and from the Bay Trail
- Provision of adequate night lighting to the facility, surrounding areas and connecting paths.
- Use of low planting or grass landscaping around the building rather than dense shrubs.

#### 2.5.3 Territorial reinforcement

Territoriality is a design concept that clearly delineates private space from semipublic and public spaces and also creates a sense of ownership. When there is a sense of ownership within a space, strangers and intruders stand out and are more easily identified.

Design for territorial reinforcement for public toilet facilities at Black Rock Gardens should consider a location with direct visual connection to the playspace/BBQ/picnic area and Bay Trail so that the facility is clearly connected to these uses.

#### 2.5.4 Other CPTED considerations

#### a) Activity support

Activity support refers to safety measures that use a specific activity planned for a specific space. It involves locating an activity so individuals engaged in that activity become part of the natural surveillance system.

- The perception of safety for normal users of a space or building, and the perception of risk for offenders, can be increased by placing safe activities in places that will discourage would-be offenders.
- High-risk activities should be shifted to safer locations to overcome the vulnerability of these activities and to take advantage of natural surveillance within the safe area.
- Gathering areas should be located in areas that provide for natural surveillance and access control or in locations away from the view of would-be offenders.
- Space can be scheduled to accommodate the most effective activities and to tolerate the appropriate intensity of particular behaviours.

#### b) <u>Maintenance</u>

Maintenance of landscaping, lighting treatment and other features can assist in the prevention of crime. Examples include

- Maintaining operational public lighting fixtures at required standards.
- Maintaining planting and landscaping prescribed standards and balancing potential conflicts between surveillance and planting as groundcover, shrubs and trees mature.

#### 2.5.5 CPTED Options Assessment

- a) Options C (opposite the clocktower) and D (near the playspace) provide the provide the highest CPTED public safety rating given clear sightlines from Beach Road, the Bay Trail and the playspace/BBQ/picnic area.
- b) Option B (north of the clocktower) provides an acceptable CPTED public safety rating as there are clear sightlines from Beach Road, the Bay Trail and from approximately 50% of the playspace/BBQ/picnic area.
- c) Option A (replacement on the site of the existing male toilet facility) provides the least unacceptable CPTED public safety rating as are restricted sightlines from Beach Road and the Bay Trail and no surveillance from the playspace/BBQ/picnic area.

# 3. Conclusion

In conclusion I recommend that Council consider redevelopment of the proposed public toilet facility in accordance with Option B further north of the clocktower between the existing toilet blocks but closer to Beach Road and the Bay Trail as this location provides the following advantages:

- Enhanced screening from existing coastal vegetation to minimise visual impact on key views to the coast from Beach Road, Bluff Road/Balcombe Road.
- Enhanced screening from existing coastal vegetation to minimise visual impact on key views to the Clocktower and beacon sculpture.
- Acceptable CPTED public safety provisions with clear lines of sight from both pedestrian crossings, the Bay Trail and more than half the picnic/BBQ/play space area.
- Close proximity to the Bay Trail allowing consolidation of proposed drinking fountain and bicycle repair facilities.
- Located close to the existing sewer minimising required ground disturbance and cost.

Implementation of this change requires only minor adjustment to the location only. The design arrangements for the proposed toilet block, drinking fountain and bicycle repair station remain the same as those shown on current Council plans.

Cultural heritage due diligence assessment will need to be rechecked and reissued to ensure consistency with previous advice but the proposed new location and design arrangements are within the current approved risk parameters.

Based on existing advice the change of location does not a planning permit as there is no removal of vegetation and no change to the design arrangements.

The proposed new location is consistent with the intent of the endorsed Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan 2016 and does not impact on other future works associated with implementation of actions. However, there will still need to be reapplication to the Department of Environment, Land Water and Planning for consent under the *Marine and Coastal Act* for the new location.

allow

Matthew Bolton Senior Associate Thompson Berrill Landscape Design Pty Ltd



# **Reference documents and materials**

This assessment is based on the following documents and reports:

- Active Tree Services, Black Rock Amenities Block Tree Protection Plan, December 2019
- All4 Cycling Pty Ltd n.d. 'Site Layout for Bike Fixtation Deluxe Public Work Stand'
- Ardent Architects Pty Ltd 2019 'Bayside Standard Two Bays Amenities Block' Concept Design Sheet 101. Bayside City Council, Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan, May 2016
- A.S. James P/L, Proposed Black Rock Toilet Block, Beach Road, Black Rock, Geotechnical Investigation, 2019
- Bayside City Council, Black Rock Foreshore Masterplan, May 2016
- Bayside City Council, Public Toilet Strategy 2019-2023
- Botton and Gardiner n.d. 'Prospect Drinking Fountain Install Instruction Book'
- DELWP, Victorian Marine and Coastal Policy March 2020
- DELWP, Coastal Siting and Design Guidelines for structures on Victorian coast, May 2020.
- CIR Consulting Engineers Pty Ltd 'Proposed Ground Slab Tender Option Toilet Block Beach Road, Black Rock: Footing Plan mand Details Revision P1 2019
- Erbas 2019 'Bayside Council Black Rock Toilets Renewal: Electrical Services Design and Construct Performance Specifications and Services Plan' 2019
- Heritage Insight, Requirement for Cultural Heritage Management Plan, Toilet, Water Fountain and Bike Repair Station at Black Rock, March 2020
- Heritage Insight, City of Bayside Indigenous Heritage Study Volume 1
- Urban initiatives, Bayside Coastal Management Plan, Bayside City Council, 2014.
- Victorian Coastal Council, Victorian Coastal Strategy, Victorian Coastal Council, 2014
- Victoria Police, Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design guidelines, June 2015



- Figure 1 Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Location Options, November 2020
- Figure 2

Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Location Views 1 and 2, November 2020

- Figure 3 Black Rock Gardens New Public Toilet Facility Location Views 3 and 4, November 2020
- Ardent Architects P/L 2019 'Bayside Standard Two Bays Amenities Block' Concept Design Sheet 101.







View 1 – Beach Road (north approach)



View 2 – Balcombe Road (east approach)



Black Rock GardensFigure 2New Public Toilet Facility Location Views 1 and 2November 2020



View 3 – Pedestrian crossing (south approach)



View 4 – From playspace/picnic area



Black Rock GardensFigure 3New Public Toilet Facility Location Views 3 and 4November 2020











Ardent Architects Pty. Ltd. Design, Planning, Project Management Ground Floor 21 Shierlaw Ave. Canterbury, 3126				Client BAYSIDE CITY COUNCIL	Sheet Name COVER PAGE	Date 09/11/2018	Sheet No.
Ph: +61 3 9889 3317 Fax: +61 3 9882 7633 info@ardentarchitects.com www.ardentarchitects.com	Rev	Date	Description	Project Address N/A	Project BAYSIDE STANDARD TWO BAY - AMENITIES BLOCK - CONCEPT	Scale	)A3

- COVER PAGE 101
  - SITE PLAN 102
- PLAN AND ELEVATIONS 103
  - SECTIONS 104
- AXONOMETRIC VIEWS 105
  - FINISHES 106

#### CONCEPT DESIGN

lo. 101

Revision No. 01